







Digital servitization business typologies in the manufacturing sector

V. Arioli^{a,*}  0000-0001-8013-6597, G. Pezzotta^{a,j}  0000-0001-7983-8356,
D. Romero^b  0000-0003-3610-0751, F. Adrodegari^{c,j}  0000-0001-7939-4150,
R. Sala^a  0000-0001-7671-6927, M. Rapaccini^{d,j}  0000-0003-4499-0627,
N. Saccani^{c,j}  0000-0002-4603-5060, U. Marjanovic^e  0000-0002-8389-6927,
S. Rakic^e  0000-0002-9021-8585, S. West^f  0000-0002-8042-1459,
O. Stoll^f  0000-0002-1918-3842, S. A. Wiesner^g  0000-0002-5073-6927,
M. Bertoni^h  0000-0002-5076-3300, U. Lopez Odriozolaⁱ  0000-0003-3577-2118,
F. Pirola^{a,j}  0000-0003-4633-7568, P. Gaiardelli^{a,j}  0000-0002-2207-3628

^a University of Bergamo, Department of Management, Information and Production Engineering, Dalmine, Italy;

^b Tecnológico de Monterrey, Departments of Industrial Engineering and Mechatronics, Mexico City, Mexico;

^c University of Brescia, Department of Industrial and Mechanical Engineering, Brescia, Italy;

^d University of Florence, Department of Industrial Engineering, Florence, Italy;

^e University of Novi Sad, Faculty of Technical Sciences, Novi Sad, Serbia;

^f Luzern University of Applied Sciences and Arts Technik & Architektur, Institute of Innovation and Technology Management, Horw, Switzerland;

^g BIBA - Bremer Institut für Produktion und Logistik GmbH, Bremen, Germany;

^h Blekinge Institute of Technology, Karlskrona, Sweden;

ⁱ Mondragon University, Gipuzkoa, Spain;

^j Research Center on Innovation and Service Management in Industrial Firms (ASAP), Florence, Italy

References

- [1] S. Vandermerwe and J. Rada, 'Servitization of business: Adding value by adding services', *Eur. Manag. J.*, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 314–324, Dec. 1988, doi: 10.1016/0263-2373(88)90033-3.
- [2] O. K. Mont, 'Clarifying the concept of product-service system', *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 237–245, 2002, doi: 10.1016/S0959-6526(01)00039-7.
- [3] C. Raddats, P. Naik, and A. Z. Bigdeli, 'Creating value in servitization through digital service innovations', *Ind. Mark. Manag.*, vol. 104, pp. 1–13, Jul. 2022, doi: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2022.04.002.
- [4] F. Vendrell-Herrero, O. F. Bustinza, G. Parry, and N. Georgantzis, 'Servitization, digitization and supply chain interdependency', *Ind. Mark. Manag.*, vol. 60, pp. 69–81, Jan. 2017, doi: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2016.06.013.
- [5] A. Sklyar, C. Kowalkowski, B. Tronvoll, and D. Sorhammar, 'Organizing for digital servitization: A service ecosystem perspective', *J. Bus. Res.*, vol. 104, pp. 450–460, Nov. 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.02.012.
- [6] Y. Chen, I. Visnjic, V. Parida, and Z. Zhang, 'On the road to digital servitization - The (dis)continuous interplay between business model and digital technology', *Int. J. Oper. Prod. Manag.*, vol. 41, no. 5, pp. 694–722, Jan. 2021, doi: 10.1108/IJOPM-08-2020-0544.
- [7] C. Favoretto, G. H. S. Mendes, M. G. Oliveira, P. A. Cauchick-Miguel, and W. Coreynen, 'From servitization to digital servitization: How digitalization transforms companies' transition towards services', *Ind. Mark. Manag.*, vol. 102, pp. 104–121, Apr. 2022, doi: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2022.01.003.

- [8] S. Galvani and R. Bocconcelli, 'Intra- and inter-organizational tensions of a digital servitization strategy. Evidence from the mechatronic sector in Italy', *J. Bus. Ind. Mark.*, vol. 37, no. 13, pp. 1–18, Dec. 2022, doi: 10.1108/Jbim-03-2021-0183.
- [9] E. Marcon et al., 'Capabilities supporting digital servitization: A multi-actor perspective', *Ind. Mark. Manag.*, vol. 103, pp. 97–116, May 2022, doi: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2022.03.003.
- [10] C. Cimini, F. Adrodegari, T. Paschou, A. Rondini, and G. Pezzotta, 'Digital servitization and competence development: A case-study research', *Cirp J. Manuf. Sci. Technol.*, vol. 32, pp. 447–460, Jan. 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.cirpj.2020.12.005.
- [11] D. Lee, S. N. Yoon, and M. D. Prasad, 'Integrating Digital Transformation and Servitization into Digital Servitization: A Case Study on Domino's', *Glob. Bus. Finance Rev.*, vol. 27, no. 5, pp. 1–16, 2022, doi: 10.17549/gbfr.2022.27.5.1.
- [12] W. M. S. K. Weerabahu, P. Samaranyake, D. Nakandala, H. Lau, and D. N. Malaarachchi, 'Barriers to the adoption of digital servitization: a case of the Sri Lankan manufacturing sector', *Int. J. Emerg. Mark.*, Dec. 2022, doi: 10.1108/Ijoem-01-2022-0011.
- [13] K. Chirumalla, L. Leoni, and P. Oghazi, 'Moving from servitization to digital servitization: Identifying the required dynamic capabilities and related microfoundations to facilitate the transition', *J. Bus. Res.*, vol. 158, 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.jbusres.2023.113668.
- [14] C. A. González Chávez, G. Unamuno, M. Despeisse, B. Johansson, D. Romero, and J. Stahre, 'Analyzing the risks of digital servitization in the machine tool industry', *Robot. Comput.-Integr. Manuf.*, vol. 82, 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.rcim.2022.102520.
- [15] M.-A. Le-Dain, L. Benhayoun, J. Matthews, and M. Liard, 'Barriers and opportunities of digital servitization for SMEs: the effect of smart Product-Service System business models', *Serv. Bus.*, 2023, doi: 10.1007/s11628-023-00520-4.
- [16] T. Paschou, M. Rapaccini, F. Adrodegari, and N. Saccani, 'Digital servitization in manufacturing: A systematic literature review and research agenda', *Ind. Mark. Manag.*, vol. 89, pp. 278–292, Aug. 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2020.02.012.
- [17] A. G. Frank, L. S. Dalenogare, and N. F. Ayala, 'Industry 4.0 technologies: Implementation patterns in manufacturing companies', *Int. J. Prod. Econ.*, vol. 210, pp. 15–26, Apr. 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.ijpe.2019.01.004.
- [18] M. L. Martin-Pena, J. M. Sanchez-Lopez, and E. Diaz-Garrido, 'Servitization and digitalization in manufacturing: the influence on firm performance', *J. Bus. Ind. Mark.*, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 564–574, Aug. 2019, doi: 10.1108/jbim-12-2018-0400.
- [19] M. Kohtamäki, V. Parida, P. C. Patel, and H. Gebauer, 'The relationship between digitalization and servitization: The role of servitization in capturing the financial potential of digitalization', *Technol. Forecast. Soc. Change*, vol. 151, 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.techfore.2019.119804.
- [20] A. Sofic, S. Rakić, G. Pezzotta, B. Markoski, V. Arioli, and U. Marjanovic, 'Smart and Resilient Transformation of Manufacturing Firms', *Processes*, vol. 10, p. 2674, Dec. 2022, doi: 10.3390/pr10122674.
- [21] S. Rakic, M. Pero, A. Sianesi, and U. Marjanovic, 'Digital Servitization and Firm Performance: Technology Intensity Approach', *Inzinerine Ekon.-Eng. Econ.*, vol. 33, no. 4, pp. 398–413, 2022, doi: 10.5755/j01.ee.33.4.29649.
- [22] M. Abou-foul, J. L. Ruiz-Alba, and A. Soares, 'The impact of digitalization and servitization on the financial performance of a firm: an empirical analysis', *Prod. Plan. Control*, vol. 32, no. 12, pp. 975–989, 2021, doi: 10.1080/09537287.2020.1780508.
- [23] A. A. Kharlamov and G. Parry, 'The impact of servitization and digitization on productivity and profitability of the firm: a systematic approach', *Prod. Plan. Control*, vol. 32, no. 3, pp. 185–197, 2021, doi: 10.1080/09537287.2020.1718793.
- [24] S. Galvani, E. Carloni, R. Bocconcelli, and A. Pagano, 'From After-Sales to Advanced Services: A Network Analysis on the Impacts of Digital Servitization Evolution', *Sustainability*, vol. 14, no. 14, Jul. 2022, doi: 10.3390/su14148308.
- [25] C. Münch, E. Marx, L. Benz, E. Hartmann, and M. Matzner, 'Capabilities of digital servitization: Evidence from the socio-technical systems theory', *Technol. Forecast. Soc. Change*, vol. 176, 2022, doi: 10.1016/j.techfore.2021.121361.
- [26] Z. Tóth, A. Silyar, C. Kowalkowski, D. Sörhammar, B. Tronvoll, and O. Wirths, 'Tensions in digital servitization through a paradox lens', *Ind. Mark. Manag.*, vol. 102, pp. 438–450, 2022, doi: 10.1016/j.indmarman.2022.02.010.
- [27] M. Rapaccini, M. Paiola, L. Cinquini, and R. Giannetti, 'Digital servitization journey in small- and medium-sized enterprises: the contribution of knowledge-intensive business firms', *J. Bus. Ind. Mark.*, vol. 38, no. 6, pp. 1362–1375, 2023, doi: 10.1108/jbim-01-2022-0008.
- [28] A. Janković, F. Adrodegari, N. Saccani, and N. Simeunović, 'Improving Service Business of Industrial Companies Through Data: Conceptualization and Application', *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manag.*, vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 78–87, 2022, doi: 10.24867/ijiem-2022-2-302.
- [29] C. H. Li and Y. T. Chow, 'A multi-group analysis of car-hailing and taxi on loyalty intention in Hong Kong', *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manag.*, vol. 15, no. 3, pp. 196–212, 2024, doi: 10.24867/IJIEEM-2024-3-357.
- [30] T. S. Baines et al., 'State-of-the-art in product-service systems', *Proc. Inst. Mech. Eng. Part B J. Eng. Manuf.*, vol. 221, no. 10, pp. 1543–1552, 2007, doi: 10.1243/09544054JEM858.
- [31] T. Paschou, M. Rapaccini, C. Peters, F. Adrodegari, and N. Saccani, 'Developing a Maturity Model for Digital Servitization in Manufacturing Firms', *Lect. Notes Multidiscip. Ind. Eng.*, vol. Part F201, pp. 413–425, 2020, doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-43616-2_44.
- [32] M. Khan, D. Schaefer, and J. Milisavljevic-Syed, 'Maturity Model Development for Digital Servitization of Manufacturing SMEs', presented at the *Advances in Transdisciplinary Engineering*, 2022, pp. 67–72. doi: 10.3233/ATDE220567.
- [33] M. Kolagar, W. Reim, V. Parida, and D. Sjödin, 'Digital servitization strategies for SME internationalization: the interplay between digital service maturity and ecosystem involvement', *J. Serv. Manag.*, vol. 33, no. 1, pp. 143–162, Jan. 2022, doi: 10.1108/JOSM-11-2020-0428.
- [34] M. J. Grant and A. Booth, 'A typology of reviews: an analysis of 14 review types and associated methodologies', *Health Inf. Libr. J.*, vol. 26, no. 2, pp. 91–108, Jun. 2009, doi: 10.1111/j.1471-1842.2009.00848.x.
- [35] F. Pirola, X. Boucher, S. Wiesner, and G. Pezzotta, 'Digital technologies in product-service systems: a literature review and a research agenda', *Comput. Ind.*, vol. 123, 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.compind.2020.103301.
- [36] V. Arioli, G. Ruggeri, R. Sala, F. Pirola, and G. Pezzotta, 'A Methodology for the Design and Engineering of Smart Product Service Systems: An Application in the Manufacturing Sector', *Sustainability*, vol. 15, p. 64, 2023, doi: 10.3390/su15010064.
- [37] M. Bertoni and A. Bertoni, 'Designing solutions with the product-service systems digital twin: What is now and what is next?', *Comput. Ind.*, vol. 138, p. 103629, Jun. 2022, doi: 10.1016/j.compind.2022.103629.
- [38] R. Koide, H. Yamamoto, K. Nansai, and S. Murakami, 'Agent-based model for assessment of multiple circular economy strategies: Quantifying product-service diffusion, circularity, and sustainability', *Resour. Conserv. Recycl.*, vol. 199, p. 107216, Dec. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.resconrec.2023.107216.
- [39] S. Oh, Y. S. Hong, J. Lee, and Y. S. Kim, 'An evaluation method for business models in product-service systems design', in *Proceedings of the Design Society*, 2021, pp. 427–436. doi: 10.1017/pds.2021.43.

- [40] M. Roci and A. Rashid, 'Economic and environmental impact of circular business models: A case study of White Goods-as-a-Service using multi-method simulation modelling', *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 407, p. 137147, Jun. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2023.137147.
- [41] E. Kohlbeck, P. A. Cauchick-Miguel, G. H. D. S. Mendes, and T. T. D. S. Zomer, 'A Longitudinal History-Based Review of the Product-Service System: Past, Present, and Future', *Sustain. Switz.*, vol. 15, no. 15, 2023, doi: 10.3390/su151511922.
- [42] K. Wrasse, H. Hayka, and R. Stark, 'Simulation of product-service-systems piloting with agent-based models (outlined revision)', in *Procedia CIRP*, 2015, pp. 108-113. doi: 10.1016/j.procir.2015.02.150.
- [43] D. Feng, J. Zhou, L. Jing, S. Jiang, T. Wu, and X. Jiang, 'Adaptability evaluation of conceptual design for smart product-service system: An integrated rough DEMATEL and Bayesian network model', *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 417, p. 137999, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2023.137999.
- [44] T. Blüher, T. Riedelsheimer, S. Gogineni, A. Klemichen, and R. Stark, 'Systematic literature review-Effects of PSS on sustainability based on use case assessments', *Sustain. Switz.*, vol. 12, no. 17, 2020, doi: 10.3390/su12176989.
- [45] P. Roman, G. Thiry, C. Muylaert, C. Ruwet, and K. Maréchal, 'Defining and identifying strongly sustainable product-service systems (SSPSS)', *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 391, p. 136295, Mar. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2023.136295.
- [46] M. A. Khan, S. Mittal, S. West, and T. Wuest, 'Review on upgradability - A product lifetime extension strategy in the context of product service systems', *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 204, pp. 1154-1168, 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.08.329.
- [47] M. Kim, C. Lim, and J. Hsuan, 'From technology enablers to circular economy: Data-driven understanding of the overview of servitization and product-service systems in Industry 4.0', *Comput. Ind.*, vol. 148, p. 103908, Jun. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.compind.2023.103908.
- [48] O. Gelo, D. Braakmann, and G. Benetka, 'Quantitative and Qualitative Research: Beyond the Debate', *Integr. Psychol. Behav. Sci.*, vol. 42, no. 3, pp. 266-290, Sep. 2008, doi: 10.1007/s12124-008-9078-3.
- [49] C. E. Lunneborg, 'Convenience Sample', in *The Blackwell Encyclopedia of Sociology*, John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, 2007. doi: 10.1002/9781405165518.wbeosc131.
- [50] D. R. Cooper and P. Schindler, *Business research methods*. Mcgraw-hill, 2014.
- [51] A. Bikfalvi, G. Lay, S. Maloca, and B. R. Waser, 'Servitization and networking: Large-scale survey findings on product-related services', *Serv. Bus.*, vol. 7, no. 1, pp. 61-82, 2013, doi: 10.1007/s11628-012-0145-y.
- [52] B. Wibowo, N. A. Masrurah, Y. U. Kasanah, F. Trapsilawati, Subagyo, and M. A. Ilhami, 'Toward a taxonomy of micro and small manufacturing enterprises', *Commun. Sci. Technol.*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 74-80, Dec. 2019, doi: 10.21924/cst.4.2.2019.120.
- [53] E. Conti, F. Camillo, and T. Pencarelli, 'The impact of digitalization on marketing activities in manufacturing companies', *TQM J.*, vol. 35, no. 9, pp. 59-82, Jan. 2023, doi: 10.1108/TQM-11-2022-0329.
- [54] R. Garland, 'The Mid-Point on a Rating Scale: Is it Desirable?', 1991. Accessed: May 02, 2024. [Online]. Available: <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/The-Mid-Point-on-a-Rating-Scale%3A-Is-it-Desirable-Garland/e9eb4f1725b0d3923e7e1ade8efda2aabb739c49>
- [55] P. Gaiardelli, B. Resta, V. Martinez, R. Pinto, and P. Albores, 'A classification model for product-service offerings', *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 66, pp. 507-519, Mar. 2014, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2013.11.032.
- [56] F. Acito, 'Cluster Analysis', in *Predictive Analytics with KNIME: Analytics for Citizen Data Scientists*, F. Acito, Ed., Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland, 2023, pp. 267-298. doi: 10.1007/978-3-031-45630-5_13.
- [57] R. Holman, C. A. Glas, R. Lindeboom, A. H. Zwinderman, and R. J. de Haan, 'Practical methods for dealing with "not applicable" item responses in the AMC Linear Disability Score project', *Health Qual. Life Outcomes*, 2004.
- [58] T. Calinski and J. Harabasz, 'A dendrite method for cluster analysis', *Commun. Stat. - Theory Methods*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1-27, 1974, doi: 10.1080/03610927408827101.
- [59] D. Romero, P. Gaiardelli, G. Pezzotta, and S. Cavaliere, 'The Impact of Digital Technologies on Services Characteristics: Towards Digital Servitization', F. Ameri, K. E. Stecke, G. von Cieminski, and D. Kiritsis, Eds., in *IFIP Advances in Information and Communication Technology*, vol. 566. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2019, pp. 493-501. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-30000-5_61.
- [60] G. Pezzotta et al., 'The Digital Servitization of Manufacturing Sector: Evidence from a Worldwide Digital Servitization Survey,' in *Advances in Production Management Systems. Production Management Systems for Responsible Manufacturing, Service, and Logistics Futures (APMS 2023)*, E. Alfnes, A. Romsdal, J. O. Strandhagen, G. von Cieminski, and D. Romero, Eds. Cham, Switzerland: Springer, 2023, vol. 690, *IFIP Advances in Information and Communication Technology*. doi: 10.1007/978-3-031-43666-6_12.