



Application of a proposed additive manufacturing performance measurement system in a Brazilian industry

A. Neuenfeldt Júnior^{a,*}, P. Nogueira^a, M. Francescato^a, J. Siluk^a, S. De Paris^a, M. Mandlhate^a

^a Federal University of Santa Maria, Santa Maria, Brazil

References

- [1] G. Liu, X. Zhang, X. Chen, Y. He, L. Cheng, M. Huo, and J. and Lu, "Additive manufacturing of structural materials", *Mater. Sci. Eng. R: Reports*, vol. 145, p. 100596, 2021, doi:10.1016/j.mser.2020.100596.
- [2] S. H. Huang, P. Liu, A. Mokasdar, and L. Hou, "Additive manufacturing and its societal impact: a literature review", *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Technol.*, vol. 67, no. 5, pp. 1191-1203, 2013, doi:10.1007/s00170-012-4558-5.
- [3] I. Campbell, D. Bourell, and I. Gibson, "Additive manufacturing: rapid prototyping comes of age," *Rapid Prototyping J.*, vol. 18, no. 4, pp. 255-258, 2012, doi:10.1080/13552541211231563.
- [4] D. R. Evers, A. T. Potter, J. Gosling, and M. M. Naim, "The flexibility of industrial additive manufacturing systems", *Int. J. Oper. Prod. Manage.*, vol. 38, no. 12, pp. 2313-2343, 2018, doi:10.1108/IJOPM-04-2016-0200.
- [5] S. A. Tofail, E. P. Koumoulos, A. Bandyopadhyay, S. Bose, L. O'Donoghue, and C. Charitidis, "Additive manufacturing: scientific and technological challenges, market uptake and opportunities", *Mater. Today*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 22-37, 2018, doi:10.1016/j.mattod.2017.07.001.
- [6] B. Vayre, F. Vignat, and F. Villeneuve, "Metallic additive manufacturing: state-of-the-art review and prospects," *Mech. Ind.*, vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 89-96, 2012, doi: 10.1051/meca/2012003.
- [7] O. A. Mohamed, S. H. Masood, and J. L. Bhowmik, "Investigation of dynamic elastic deformation of parts processed by fused deposition modeling additive manufacturing," *Adv. Prod. Eng. Manage.*, vol. 11, no. 3, pp. 227-238, 2016. doi: 10.14743/apem2016.3.223.
- [8] K. Rajaguru, T. Karthikeyan, and V. Vijayan, "Additive manufacturing-State of art," *Mater. today: proceedings*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 628-633, 2020. doi: 10.1016/j.matpr.2019.06.728.
- [9] C. Wang, X. P. Tan, S. B. Tor, and C. S. Lim, "Machine learning in additive manufacturing: State-of-the-art and perspectives", *Addit. Manuf.*, vol. 36, p. 101538, 2020, doi:10.1016/j.addma.2020.101538.
- [10] I. Gibson, D. W. Rosen, B. Stucker, M. Khorasani, D. Rosen, B. Stucker, and M. Khorasani, *Additive manufacturing technologies*, Springer, Switzerland, 2021.
- [11] S. Lim, R. A. Buswell, T. T. Le, S. A. Austin, A. G. Gibb, and T. Thorpe, "Developments in construction-scale additive manufacturing processes", *Autom. Constr.*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 262-268, 2012, doi: 10.1016/j.autcon.2011.06.010.
- [12] W. E. Frazier, "Metal additive manufacturing: a review," *J. Mater. Eng. Perform.*, vol. 23, no. 6, pp. 1917-1928, 2014. doi: 10.1007/s11665-014-0958-z.
- [13] Y. Jin, S. Ji, X. Li, and J. Yu, "A scientometric review of hotspots and emerging trends in additive manufacturing", *J. Manuf. Technol. Manage.*, vol. 28, no. 1, pp. 18-38, 2017, doi: 10.1108/JMTM-12-2015-0114.
- [14] R. Silvi, M. Bartolini, A. Raffoni, and F. Visani, "The practice of strategic performance measurement systems: Models, drivers and information effectiveness," *Int. J. Product. Perform. Manage.*, vol. 64, no. 2, pp. 194-227, doi:10.1108/IJPPM-01-2014-0010.
- [15] C. R. Silva Júnior, J. C. M. Siluk, A. Neuenfeldt Júnior, M. Francescato, and C. Michelin, "A competitiveness measurement system of Brazilian start-ups," *Int. J. Product. Perform. Manage.*, doi:10.1108/IJPPM-02-2022-0098.
- [16] M. Francescato, A. Neuenfeldt Júnior, F. I. Kubota, G. Guimarães, and B. de Oliveira, "Lean Six Sigma case studies literature overview: critical success factors and difficulties," *Int. J. Product. Perform. Manage.*, vol. 72, no. 1, pp. 1-23, doi:10.1108/IJPPM-12-2021-0681.

- [17] J. Ram and D. Corkindale, "How "critical" are the critical success factors (CSFs)? Examining the role of CSFs for ERP," *Bus. Process. Manage. J.*, vol. 20, no. 1, pp. 151-174, 2014.
- [18] M. S. Bhatia and S. Kumar, "Critical success factors of industry 4.0 in automotive manufacturing industry," *IEEE Trans. Eng. Manage.*, vol. 69, no. 5, pp. 2439-2453, 2020.
- [19] M. Bongo, D. P. Abellana, S. A. Jr R. A., Caballes, C. Himang, J. J. Obiso, and C. Deocarís, "Critical success factors in implementing Industry 4.0 from an organisational point of view: a literature analysis," *Int. J. Adv. Oper. Manage.*, vol. 12, no. 3, pp. 273-301, 2020.
- [20] M. T. Escobar and J. M. Moreno-Jiménez, "Aggregation of individual preference structures in AHP-group decision making," *Group Decis. Negot.*, vol. 16, no. 4, pp. 287-301, 2007.
- [21] A. Ishizaka, D. Balkenborg, and T. Kaplan, "Influence of aggregation and measurement scale on ranking a compromise alternative in AHP," *J. Oper. Res. Soc.*, vol. 62, no. 4, pp. 700-710, 2011.
- [22] A. Kolesárová, J. Li, and R. Mesiar, "k-additive aggregation functions and their characterization," *Eur. J. Oper. Res.*, vol. 265, no. 3, pp. 985-992, 2018.
- [23] O. Salunkhe and Å. F. Berglund, "Industry 4.0 enabling technologies for increasing operational flexibility in final assembly," *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manage.*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 38-48, 2022, doi: 10.24867/IJIEEM-2022-1-299.
- [24] G. A. Adam and D. Zimmer, "Design for Additive Manufacturing—Element transitions and aggregated structures," *CIRP J. Manuf. Sci. Technol.*, vol. 7, no. 1, pp. 20-28, 2014, doi: 10.1016/j.cirpj.2013.10.001.
- [25] J. Plocher and A. Panesar, "Review on design and structural optimisation in additive manufacturing: Towards next-generation lightweight structures," *Mater. Des.*, vol. 183, p. 108164, 2019, doi:10.1016/j.matdes.2019.108164.
- [26] R. Kleer and F. T. Piller, "Local manufacturing and structural shifts in competition: Market dynamics of additive manufacturing," *Int. J. Prod. Econ.*, vol. 216, no. 1, pp. 23-34, 2019, doi:10.1016/j.ijpe.2019.04.019.
- [27] W. Gao et al., "The status, challenges, and future of additive manufacturing in engineering," *Comput. Aided Des.*, vol. 69, no. 1, pp. 65-89, 2015, doi:10.1016/j.cad.2015.04.001.
- [28] M. Francescato, A. L. Neuenfeldt Júnior, E. Silva, J. C. Furtado, and D. Bromberger, "Impact of minimum distance constraints on sheet metal waste for plasma cutting," *PLoS One*, vol. 18, p. e0292032, 2023.
- [29] A. Neuenfeldt Junior, M. Francescato, O. Araujo, D. T. Disconzi, and G. Stieler, "The machining torch movement for the rectangular plasma sheet metal cut," *PLoS One*, v. 18, p. e0291184-1, 2023.
- [30] M. Vaezi, H. Seitz, and S. Yang, "A review on 3D micro-additive manufacturing technologies," *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Technol.*, vol. 67, no. 5, pp. 1721-1754, 2013, doi:10.1007/s00170-012-4605-2.
- [31] D. Herzog, V. Seyda, E. Wycisk, and C. Emmelmann, "Additive manufacturing of metals," *Acta Mater.*, vol. 117, pp. 371-392, 2016, doi:10.1016/j.actamat.2016.07.019.
- [32] C. Klahn, B. Leutenecker, and M. Meboldt, "Design Strategies for the Process of Additive Manufacturing," *Procedia CIRP*, vol. 36, pp. 230-235, 2015, doi:10.1016/j.procir.2015.01.082.
- [33] M. Schröder, B. Falk, and R. Schmitt, "Evaluation of cost structures of additive manufacturing processes using a new business model," *Procedia Cirp*, vol. 30, pp. 311-316, 2015, doi:10.1016/j.procir.2015.02.144.
- [34] V. Kumar, B. R. Isanaka, S. Gupta, and V. Kushvala, "Future Trends and Technologies in Additive and Subtractive Manufacturing", In: *Additive and Subtractive Manufacturing of Composites*, Singapore: Springer, 2021, 227-247, doi:10.1007/978-981-16-3184-9_9.
- [35] N. Guo and M. Leu, "Additive manufacturing: technology, applications and research needs," *Front. Mech. Eng.*, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 215-243, 2013, doi:10.1007/s11465-013-0248-8.
- [36] S. H. Huang, P. Liu, A. Mokasdar, and L. Hou, "Additive manufacturing and its societal impact: a literature review", *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Technol.*, vol. 67, no. 1, pp. 1191-1203, 2012, doi:10.1007/s00170-012-4558-5.
- [37] C. Weller, R. Kleer, and F. T. Piller, "Economic implications of 3D printing: Market structure models in light of additive manufacturing revisited," *Int. J. Prod. Econ.*, vol. 164, no. 1, pp. 43-56, 2015, doi:10.1016/j.ijpe.2015.02.020.
- [38] M. Delić, D. R. Eysers, and J. Mikulic, "Additive manufacturing: empirical evidence for supply chain integration and performance from the automotive industry," *Supply Chain Manage. Int. J.*, vol. 24, no. 5, pp. 604-621, 2019, doi:10.1108/SCM-12-2017-0406.
- [39] G. G. Saueressig, A. de Paris, J. M. Bauer, J. Luchese, M. A. Sellitto, and J. A. Valle Antunes Jr., "Strategic Materials Positioning Matrix: An Application in the Automotive Industry in Southern Brazil", *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manage.*, vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 77-89, 2017, doi: 10.24867/IJIEEM-2017-2-109.
- [40] M. E. Porter, *Competitive Strategy: Techniques for analyzing industries and competitors*. New York: Free, 1980.
- [41] S. K. Thomas, A. Ali, A. Alarjani, and E.-A. Attia, "Simulation based performance improvement: A case study on automotive industries," *Int. J. Simul. Model.*, vol. 21, no. 3, pp. 406-416, 2022, doi: 10.2507/IJSIMM21-3-606.
- [42] N. Li et al., "Progress in additive manufacturing on new materials: A review," *J. Mater. Sci. Technol.*, vol. 35, no. 2, pp. 242-269, 2019, doi:10.1016/j.jmst.2018.09.002.
- [43] T. DebRoy et al., "Additive manufacturing of metallic components—process, structure and properties," *Prog. Mater. Sci.*, vol. 92, pp. 112-224, 2018, doi:10.1016/j.pmatsci.2017.10.001.
- [44] Z. Hu and S. Mahadevan, "Uncertainty quantification and management in additive manufacturing: current status, needs, and opportunities," *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Technol.*, vol. 93, no. 1, pp. 2855-2874, 2017, doi:10.1007/s00170-017-0703-5.
- [45] A. S. Sohal, J. Sarros, R. Schroder, and P. O'neill, "Adoption framework for advanced manufacturing Technologies", *Int. J. Prod. Res.*, vol. 44, no. 1, pp. 5225-5246, 2006, doi:10.1080/00207540600558320.
- [46] P. Kulkarni, A. Kumar, G. Chate, and P. Dandannavar, "Elements of additive manufacturing technology adoption in small-and medium-sized companies", *Innov. Manage. Rev.*, vol. 18, no. 4, pp. 400-416, 2021, doi:10.1108/INMR-02-2020-0015.
- [47] H. Bikas, P. Stavropoulos, and G. Chryssolouris, "Additive manufacturing methods and modelling approaches: a critical review," *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Technol.*, vol. 83, no. 1, pp. 389-405, 2016, doi:10.1007/s00170-015-7576-2.
- [48] E. Atzeni and A. Salmi, "Economics of additive manufacturing for end-usable metal parts," *Int. J. Adv. Manuf. Technol.*, vol. 62, no. 1, pp. 1147-1155, 2012, doi:10.1007/s00170-011-3878-1.
- [49] F. T. Piller, C. Weller, and R. Kleer, "Business Models with Additive Manufacturing—Opportunities and Challenges from the Perspective of Economics and Management," *Adv. Prod. Technol.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 39-48, 2015, doi:10.1007/978-3-319-12304-2_4.

- [50] M. Khorram Niaki and F. Nonino, "Additive manufacturing management: a review and future research agenda," *Int. J. Prod. Res.*, vol. 55, no. 5, pp. 1419–1439, 2017, doi:10.1080/00207543.2016.1229064.
- [51] M. K. Niaki and F. Nonino, *The management of additive manufacturing*. Birmingham, UK: Springer, 2018.
- [52] S. Ford and M. Despeisse, "Additive manufacturing and sustainability: an exploratory study of the advantages and challenges," *J. Cleaner Prod.*, vol. 137, pp. 1573–1587, 2016, doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.04.150.
- [53] K. S. Prakash, T. Nancharaih, and V. S. Rao, "Additive manufacturing techniques in manufacturing-an overview", *Mater. Today Proc.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 3873–3882, 2018, doi:10.1016/j.matpr.2017.11.642.
- [54] C. Sun, Y. Wang, M. D. McMurtrey, N. D. Jerred, F. Liou, and J. Li, "Additive manufacturing for energy: A review", *Appl. Energy*, vol. 282, p. 116041, 2021, doi:10.1016/j.apenergy.2020.116041.
- [55] T. Peng, K. Kellens, R. Tang, C. Chen, and G. Chen, "Sustainability of additive manufacturing: An overview on its energy demand and environmental impact", *Addit. Manuf.*, vol. 21, pp. 694–704, 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.addma.2018.04.022.
- [56] P. C. S. Filho et al., "A Measurement Tool for the Competitiveness of Startups' Innovation Ecosystem," *J. Knowl. Econ.*, 2023, doi: 10.1007/s13132-023-01170-7.
- [57] T. Pereira, J. V. Kennedy, and J. Potgieter, "A comparison of traditional manufacturing vs additive manufacturing, the best method for the job," *Procedia Manuf.*, vol. 30, pp. 11–18, 2019, doi:10.1016/j.promfg.2019.02.003.
- [58] N. Xu, X. Y. Hou, and N. Jia, "Optimization of multi-stage production scheduling of automated production," *Int. J. Simul. Model.*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 160–171, 2022, doi: 10.2507/IJSIMM21-1-CO3.
- [59] V. Jain and P. Ajmera, "Modelling the enablers of industry 4.0 in the Indian manufacturing industry," *Int. J. Prod. Perform. Manage.*, vol. 70, no. 6, pp. 1233–1262, 2021, doi:10.1108/IJPPM-07-2019-0317.
- [60] R. Novak, F. Valjak, N. Božetić, and M. Šercer, "Design Principle for Additive Manufacturing: Direct Metal Sintering," *Tehn. Vjesn.*, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 937–944, 2023, doi: 10.17559/TV-20210625150328.
- [61] J. Patalas-Maliszewska and M. Topczak, "A new management approach based on Additive Manufacturing technologies and Industry 4.0 requirements," *Adv. Prod. Eng. Manage.*, vol. 16, no. 1, pp. 125–135, 2021, doi:10.14743/apem2021.1.389.
- [62] A. Neuenfeldt-Junior, M. Cheiram, M. Eckhardt, C. Scheuer, J. Siluk, and M. Francescato, "Additive and Subtractive Rapid Prototyping Techniques: A Comparative Analysis of FDM & CNC Processes", *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manag.*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 262–273, 2021, doi: 10.24867/IJIEEM-2021-4-293.
- [63] A. Haleem and M. Javaid, "Additive Manufacturing Applications in Industry 4.0: A Review," *J. Ind. Integr. Manage.*, vol. 4, no. 4, p. 1930001, 2019, doi:10.1142/S2424862219300011.
- [64] V. Gerhardt, J. D. Santos, E. Rubin, A. Neuenfeldt, and J. C. Mairesse Siluk, "Stakeholders perception to characterize the start-ups success," *J. Technol. Manage. Innov.*, vol. 16, no. 1, pp. 38–50, 2021.
- [65] A. Neuenfeldt-Júnior, B. D. Oliveira, V. Alves, and J. Siluk, "Tactical economic business performance measurement system for urban public transport.", *Int. J. Bus. Perform. Supply Chain Modell.*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 405–422, 2022.
- [66] C. R. Silva Júnior, J. C. M. Siluk, A. Neuenfeldt Júnior, M. Francescato, and C. Michelin, "A competitiveness measurement system of Brazilian start-ups," *Int. J. Prod. Perform. Manage.*, vol. 72, no. 10, pp. 2919–2948, 2023, doi: 10.1108/IJPPM-02-2022-0098.
- [67] A. Neuenfeldt-Júnior and B. de Oliveira, "An agent-based approach to simulate the containership stowage problem," *Soft. Comput.*, vol. 26, no. 22, pp. 12583–12597, 2022, doi: 10.1007/s00500-022-07222-5.
- [68] C. R. Silva Júnior, J. C. M. Siluk, A. Neuenfeldt Júnior, C. B. Rosa, and C. D. F. Michelin, "Overview of the factors that influence the competitiveness of startups: a systematized literature review," *Gestão & Produção (Ufscar. Impresso)*, vol. 29, p. 1-23, 2022.
- [69] V. J. Gerhardt, J. C. M. Siluk, C. De Freitas Michelin, A. L. Neuenfeldt Junior, and C. P. Da Veiga, "Impact of Market Development Indicators on Company Performance," *IEEE Eng. Manage. Rev.*, vol. 50, pp. 65-84, 2022.
- [70] J. C. Alecio, A. Neuenfeldt Junior, and J. C. M. Siluk, "The cooperation between suppliers and an agro-industrial slaughterhouse: a measurement tool," *Produção (São Paulo)*, vol. 31, pp. 1-14, 2021.
- [71] J. C. M. Siluk et al., "A performance measurement decision support system method applied for technology-based firms' suppliers," *J. Decis. Syst.*, vol. 26, no. 1, pp. 93–109, 2017, doi: 10.1080/12460125.2016.1204213.
- [72] T. Saaty, "The analytic hierarchy process (AHP)," *J. Oper. Res. Soc.*, vol. 41, pp. 1073-1076, 1987, doi: 10.1016/0270-0255(87)90473-8.
- [73] P. Kumar, P. S. Brar, D. Singh, and J. Bhamu, "Fuzzy AHP approach for barriers to implement LSS in the context of Industry 4.0," *Int. J. Product. Perform. Manage.*, vol. 72, no. 9, pp. 2559-2583, 2022, doi: 10.1108/IJPPM-12-2021-0715.
- [74] C. Ramirez, A. Neuenfeldt Junior, J. C. M. Siluk, and L. Ataíde, "A literature overview about warehouse management," *Int. J. Logistics Syst. Manage.*, vol. 42, pp. 153-175, 2022.
- [75] B. Leal, J. Siluk, A. N. Júnior, G. Zen, and J. R. G. Dos Santos, "A performance measurement approach to risk valuation in startups' technology marketing," *Int. J. Bus. Excel.*, vol. 31, no. 4, pp. 521–541, 2023, doi: 10.1504/IJBEX.2023.135518.
- [76] B. Liu, C. Jiang, G. Li, and X. Huang, "Topology optimization of structures considering local material uncertainties in additive manufacturing," *Comput. Methods Appl. Mech. Eng.*, vol. 360, p. 112786, 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.cma.2019.112786.
- [77] C. Dordlofva and P. Törlind, "Evaluating design uncertainties in additive manufacturing using design artefacts: examples from space industry," *Des. Sci.*, vol. 6, p. e12, 2020, doi:10.1017/dsj.2020.11.
- [78] S. S. Babu, L. Love, R. Dehoff, W. Peter, T. R. Watkins, and S. Pannala, "Additive manufacturing of materials: Opportunities and challenges," *MRS Bull.*, vol. 40, no. 12, pp. 1154-1161, 2015, doi: 10.1557/mrs.2015.234.
- [79] I. L. De Camargo, C. A. Fortulan, and H. A. Colorado, "A review on the ceramic additive manufacturing technologies and availability of equipment and materials," *Cerâmica*, vol. 68, pp. 329-347, 2022, doi: 10.1590/0366-69132022683873331.
- [80] T. W. Simpson, C. B. Williams, and M. Hripko, "Preparing industry for additive manufacturing and its applications: Summary & recommendations from a National Science Foundation workshop," *Addit. Manuf.*, vol. 13, pp. 166-178, 2017, doi: 10.1016/j.addma.2016.08.002.
- [81] S. H. Ghaffar, J. Corker, and M. Fan, "Additive manufacturing technology and its implementation in construction as an eco-innovative solution," *Autom. Constr.*, vol. 93, pp. 1-11, 2018,
- [82] R. Martens, S. K. Fan, and R. J. Dwyer, "Successful approaches for implementing additive manufacturing," *World J. Entrep. Manage. Sustain. Dev.*, vol. 16, no. 2, pp. 131-148, 2020, doi: 10.1108/WJEMSD-12-2019-0100.

- [83] A. B. Badiru, V. V. Valencia, and D. Liu, *Additive manufacturing handbook: product development for the defense industry*. CRC Press, 2017.
- [84] M. Zaidi and S. M. Hasan, "Supply Chain Risk Prioritization Using AHP and Framework Development: A Perspective of the Automotive Industry", *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manag.*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 283-293, 2022, doi: 10.24867/IJIEM-2022-4-319.
- [85] L. F. C. S. Durão, M. O. Guimarães, M. S. Salerno, and E. Zancul, "Uncertainty Management in Advanced Manufacturing Implementation: The Case for Learning Factories," *Procedia Manuf.*, vol. 31, pp. 213-218, 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.promfg.2019.03.034.
- [86] D. Rejeski, F. Zhao, and Y. Huang, "Research needs and recommendations on environmental implications of additive manufacturing," *Addit Manuf*, vol. 19, pp. 21-28, 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.addma.2017.10.019.
- [87] D. Böckin and A.-M. Tillman, "Environmental assessment of additive manufacturing in the automotive industry," *J. Clean. Prod.*, vol. 226, pp. 977-987, 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.04.086.
- [88] P. Manco, M. Caterino, M. Rinaldi, and M. Fera, "Additive manufacturing in green supply chains: A parametric model for life cycle assessment and cost," *Sustain. Prod. Consum.*, vol. 36, pp. 463-478, 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.spc.2023.01.015.
- [89] I. C. Baierle, J. C. M. Siluk, V. J. Gerhardt, C. de F. Michelin, Á. L. N. Junior, and E. O. B. Nara, "Worldwide Innovation and Technology Environments: Research and Future Trends Involving Open Innovation," *J. Open Innov. Technol. Mark. Complex.*, vol. 7, no. 4, p. 229, 2021, doi: 10.3390/joitmc7040229.
- [90] A. Neuenfeldt Júnior and L. Rebouças Guimarães, "A Greedy Randomized Adaptive Search Procedure Application To Solve the Travelling Salesman Problem", *Int. J. Ind. Eng. Manag.*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 238-242, 2019, doi: 10.24867/IJIEM-2019-3-243.